

Discussion

Reply to the Letter to the Editor of Dr. Chakraborti:
Comments on “Non-citation by H.R. Shaterian et al.
of the original work on the discovery of $\text{HClO}_4\text{-SiO}_2$ ”
[J. Mol. Catal. A: Chem. 272 (2007) 142–151]

H.R. Shaterian*

*Department of Chemistry, Faculty of Sciences, University of Sistan and Baluchestan,
P.O. Box 98135-674, Zahedan, Iran*

Available online 11 August 2007

We certainly respect outstanding scientific researchers, especially Professor Asit K. Chakraborti. We noticed his excellent papers that appeared in high-level journals, namely his research on $\text{HClO}_4\text{-SiO}_2$.

In our recent paper (J. Mol. Catal. A: Chem. 272 (2007) 142–151), about the further application of $\text{HClO}_4\text{-SiO}_2$ as a catalytic system, we did cite (Ref. [30]) the paper by S. Rudrawar, R.C. Besra, and A.K. Chakraborti published recently in *Synthesis* (2006, 2767–2721) on the use of $\text{HClO}_4\text{-SiO}_2$ as catalyst for 1,3-dithiolane and 1,3-dithiane formation under solvent free conditions at room temperature.

The choice of this most recent paper by Prof. Chakraborti was because this paper refers in the text to some of his

previous innovative work using the new catalytic system $\text{HClO}_4\text{-SiO}_2$, and namely its original discovery published by himself and R. Gulhane in *J. Chem. Soc. Chem. Commun.*, 2003, 1896–1897, a novel catalytic system which was also patented (Indian Patent, 266/DEL/2003 (10 March 2003)) by the same authors.

We, however, agree with Professor Chakraborti's view that his original work published in 2003 about the use of $\text{HClO}_4\text{-SiO}_2$ as catalyst for organic transformations should have been cited more specifically in our paper and will do so in the future, also including other relevant related papers by his group. We also appreciate his comments and advice regarding publication ethics.

DOI of original article: [10.1016/j.molcata.2007.08.002](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.molcata.2007.08.002).

* Tel.: +98 541 2446565; fax: +98 541 2431067.

E-mail address: hrshaterian@hamoon.usb.ac.ir.